

**THE EMERGENCE OF RELIGIOUS NATIONALISM IN  
INDONESIA: AN ANALYTICAL STUDY ON  
SELECTED SCHOLARS**

**BY**

**MUHAMMAD YUSUF SETIAWAN**

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for  
the degree of Master of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and  
Heritage (Uşūl al-Dīn and Comparative Religion)

AbdulHamid AbuSulayman Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed  
Knowledge and Human Sciences  
International Islamic University Malaysia

**JUNE 2022**

## ABSTRACT

This study aims to elaborate on the origin and development of nationalism, particularly in Indonesia. The study also analyzes some ideas of Muslim intellectuals, also known as Muslim nationalists, regarding the relationship between Islam and nationalism. Islam and nationalism issue became a prolonged polemic among significant figures during the struggle of Indonesia against colonialism. Even after Indonesia's independence, several debates concerning that issue continued and were discussed by journalists, writers, and scholars in their various medias. In this case, two different groups are involved. The secular nationalists, on one hand, propagated secular ideas along with nationalism as the basis of fights, which will eventually lead to their desire to separate religion and state. On the other hand, modernist Muslim leaders led by Haji Agus Salim, A. Hassan, M. Natsir, and Hamka refuted those ideas. They argued that religion could not be separated from the state; even further, they said that Islamic principles should be the basis of the nation and state. With the fact that most Indonesian people are Muslims, they had fought against colonialism and imperialism long before the nationalism movement occurred. Therefore, the research focuses on outlining the views and arguments of those figures and studying them comparatively to find out the causes and effects of Islam and nationalism disputes. The study has relied mainly on library research with textual analysis of some scholars' works. Finally, the study concludes that Islam and nationalism conceptually contradict one another. However, modernist Muslim figures viewed both should go hand in hand in the struggle against colonialism as long as the idea of nationalism is not placed above religious principles.

## خلاصة البحث

تهدف هذه الدراسة إلى توضيح أصل القومية وتطورها، لا سيما في إندونيسيا. وتحلل الدراسة أيضا بعض أفكار المثقفين المسلمين، المعروفين أيضا بالقوميين المسلمين، فيما يتعلق بالعلاقة بين الإسلام والقومية. أصبحت هذه القضية جدالاً مطولاً بين شخصيات بارزة أثناء نضال إندونيسيا ضد الاستعمار. حتى بعد استقلال إندونيسيا، استمرت العديد من النقاشات وناقشها الصحفيون والكتاب والعلماء في وسائل الإعلام المختلفة الخاصة بهم. في هذه الحالة، تشارك مجموعتان مختلفتان: القوميون العلمانيون، من ناحية، روجوا للأفكار العلمانية إلى جانب القومية كأساس للمعارك، الأمر الذي سيؤدي في النهاية إلى رغبتهم في فصل الدين عن الدولة. ومن ناحية أخرى، دحض زعماء المسلمين الحداثيين بقيادة الحاج أجوس سليم، أ. حسن، محمد ناتصير، وحمكا هذه الأفكار. وقد جادلوا بأنه لا يمكن فصل الدين عن الدولة؛ بل أكثر من ذلك، قالوا إن المبادئ الإسلامية يجب أن تكون أساس الأمة والدولة. مع افتراض أن معظم الإندونيسيين مسلمون، فقد حاربوا الاستعمار والإمبريالية قبل وقت طويل من ظهور الحركة القومية. لذلك يركز البحث على تلخيص آراء وحجج تلك الشخصيات ودراساتها بشكل مقارن لمعرفة أسباب وتأثيرات الخلافات الإسلامية والقومية. كما اعتمدت الدراسة بشكل أساسي على البحث في المكتبات مع التحليل النصي لبعض أعمال العلماء. أخيراً، خلصت الدراسة بأن الإسلام والقومية يتناقضان من الناحية المفاهيمية. ومع ذلك، يمكن للشخصيات الإسلامية الحداثية أن تسير جنباً إلى جنب في النضال ضد الاستعمار طالما أن فكرة القومية ليست فوق المبادئ الدينية.

## APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that in my opinion, it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Heritage (Uşul al-Dīn and Comparative Religion)

.....  
Thameem Ushama  
Supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Heritage (Uşul al-Dīn and Comparative Religion)

.....  
Adibah Abdul Rahim  
Examiner

This dissertation was submitted to the Department of Uşul al-Dīn and Comparative Religion and is accepted as a fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Heritage (Uşul al-Dīn and Comparative Religion)

.....  
Amilah Awang Abd. Rahman  
Head, Department of Uşul al-Dīn  
and Comparative Religion

This dissertation was submitted to the Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences and is accepted as a fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Heritage (Uşul al-Dīn and Comparative Religion)

.....  
Shukran Bin Abd. Rahman  
Dean, AbdulHamid  
AbuSulayman Kulliyah of  
Islamic Revealed Knowledge and  
Human Sciences

## DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Muhammad Yusuf Setiawan

Signature.....

Date.....



**INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA**

**DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF  
FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH**

**THE EMERGENCE OF RELIGIOUS NATIONALISM IN  
INDONESIA: ANALYTICAL STUDY OF SELECT SCHOLARS**

I declare that the copyright holder of this thesis/dissertation are jointly owned by the student and IIUM.

Copyright © 2022 Muhammad Yusuf Setiawan and International Islamic University Malaysia. All rights reserved.

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below

1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purpose.
3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

By signing this form, I acknowledged that I have read and understand the IIUM Intellectual Property Right and Commercialization policy.

Affirmed by Student Name

.....

Signature

.....

Date

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

*Alhamdulillahillāhi Rabbil ‘ālamīn*, all praises and thanks be to Almighty Allah for His Mercy and Blessing in giving me the opportunity, strength, and patience to initiate, carry on, and complete this thesis. I would like to express my deepest appreciation to those who have contributed towards the completion of this work. First and foremost, I must convey my highest thankfulness to my beloved parents, Dasrial and Ramayati Rahman for their unceasing moral support, love, prayer, and advice they have given me throughout my study and life.

Besides that, a special acknowledgment must be given to Prof. Dr. Thameem Ushama, who supervised this dissertation. I am, indeed, very grateful to him for his constructive criticism, for the careful attention he gave this research, and for having given generously of his time and guidance.

My sincere gratitude also goes to the Department of Uṣūl al-Dīn and Comparative Religion for its administrative assistance and all the lecturers who have taught, guided, and motivated me throughout my study at the International Islamic University Malaysia. Other than that, I would like to extend my appreciation to all my friends, especially Indonesian students in IIUM, who provided support and encouragement for me to complete my dissertation. Additionally, I would like to express my thanks to my family for their support and prayers.

Finally, may Allah bestow the finest blessings on all those who have aided and served me throughout my life, both here and in the hereafter. May Allah bless us all with His mercy and love.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....	ii
Arabic Abstract.....	iii
Declaration .....	v
Copyright Page.....	vi
Acknowledgements .....	vii
Table of Contents .....	viii
<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Background of the Study.....	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem .....	3
1.3 Significance of the Study .....	4
1.4 Research Questions .....	5
1.5 Research Objectives.....	5
1.6 Scope of the Study .....	5
1.7 Research Methodology.....	6
1.8 Literature Review .....	6
<b>CHAPTER TWO: THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONALISM.....</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1 Short Definition of Nationalism .....	13
2.2 The Historical Origin and Development of the Nationalism .....	15
2.2.1 Nationalism: From West to East and from the Middle Ages to The Modern Era .....	17
2.2.2 From Tribalism to Universalism.....	18
2.2.3 Renaissance and Reformation Era .....	20
2.3 Different Characteristics of Nationalism .....	21
2.3.1 Nationalism, Between Secularism And Religion .....	22
2.3.2 Development of Nationalism in the East .....	24
2.4 The West And Muslim Response to the Emergence of Nationalism ....	27
<b>CHAPTER THREE: THE EMERGENCE OF RELIGIOUS NATIONALISM IN INDONESIA.....</b>	<b>32</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	32
3.2 Genesis of the Nationalist Movement in Indonesia .....	32
3.2.1 The Other Factors That Influence the Emergence of Indonesian Nationalism .....	34
3.2.2 Existence of Nationalism from Resistance to Colonialism and Imperialism .....	39
3.2.3 Two Forms of Nationalism: An Ideology and a Movement .....	42
3.2.4 The Role of Secular Nationalists In National Independence .....	63
3.3 Islam and Nationalism in Indonesia.....	73
3.3.1 Islam as The Generator of Nationalist Movement.....	73
3.3.2 The Influence of Pan-Islamism (Islamic Modernism) in the Awakening of Nationalism .....	76
3.3.3 Conflicts Between Muslims and Secular Nationalists .....	84
3.4 Pancasila as an Ideology of the State: Tolerance Between Disputing Groups.....	88

<b>CHAPTER FOUR: CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF SELECT SCHOLARS .....</b>	<b>92</b>
4.1 The Impact of the Emergence of Nationalism on Muslim Lands.....	92
4.2 The Critique of Some Key Personalities on Nationalism .....	93
4.2.1 A. Hassan’s View of Nationalism .....	94
4.2.2 Mohammad Natsir Between Religion and Homeland .....	113
4.2.3 Hamka and Pancasila.....	137
4.2.4 H. Agus Salim the Leading Muslim Nationalist .....	154
4.3 Danger and the Weakness of Nationalism .....	167
<b>CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>170</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY.....</b>	<b>174</b>



# CHAPTER ONE

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Nationalism is an obvious and impelling movement in the modern and contemporary world. It has had its origin and rise in Europe, and through European influence and the example, it has been implanted in America and all other areas of Western civilization. However, its development was still affected by western Christian intervention.<sup>1</sup> It was only in the late nineteenth century that it became an outstanding feature of countries and societies across the vast expanses of Asia and Africa, amidst traditional civilizations of Muslim, Hindu, Confucian, and Buddhist. It is especially evidenced across the whole breadth of the Muslim world. In addition, Hans Kohn<sup>2</sup> had asserted that nationalism had become a worldwide movement, and its importance in Asia and Africa is growing every year. However, nationalism is not the same in all countries and at all times. It is a historical phenomenon and thus determined by the political ideas and the social structure of the various lands where it takes root.<sup>3</sup> It has had different structures and characteristics throughout its history. Sometimes it appears as an ideology, sentiment, and as a movement. Only a study of the historical growth of nationalism and a comparative study of its forms can make us understand the impact of nationalism today.

Moreover, many scholars who lived after him have different ideas regarding nationalism. Some of them define it “as a creed, a school and a pseudo-religion which the West created to fill an ideological vacuum.” It existed in Europe when the Christian dogmas were unable to fill the void of the beliefs and ideology of its adherents. Some

---

<sup>1</sup> Carlton J. H. Hayes, *Nationalism: A Religion* (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1960), 1.

<sup>2</sup> Zionist activist, journalist, and scholar of modern nationalism. Hans Kohn was born in Prague to a bilingual (Czech and German) Jewish family; his parents came from the Czech regions outside the Bohemian capital. In 1910, upon his graduation from a German high school and just before he was accepted as a student of law at the Karl-Ferdinand German University of Prague, Kohn joined the Zionist students' Bar Kochba Association, which, until the outbreak of World War I, was the center for Zionist activity in Prague. He served as its chair from 1912 to 1913. “YIVO | Kohn, Hans,” accessed June 29, 2020, [https://yivoencyclopedia.org/article.aspx/Kohn\\_Hans](https://yivoencyclopedia.org/article.aspx/Kohn_Hans).

<sup>3</sup> Paul W. Massing, Hans Kohn, and Sidney Hook, “Nationalism: Its Meaning and History,” *American Sociological Review* 21, no. 3 (June 1956): 397, <https://doi.org/10.2307/2089315>.

scholars even said that nationalism is not merely an ideology, but a new religion.<sup>4</sup> Eventually, this product of western thought was introduced to other parts of the world by Europe's growing imperial reach.<sup>5</sup> The impact of westernization experienced by Muslim communities and the colonialization of the Muslim lands by European countries consequently led to the spread of nationalism in the entire Muslim world.

In addition, after the birth of nationalism, a new discourse emerged; some scholars divide it into two kinds of different discourse, namely secular nationalism and religious nationalism. First, when the idea arose in Europe in the nineteenth, a period where the role of religion has disappeared from society and even it is contemplated dead. The complexity of the affiliation between religion and nationalism at that time has given rise to this discourse. Liah Greenfeld, in her study on nationalism, pointed out the fact.<sup>6</sup>

“What needs to be kept in mind is that the nature of nationalism is never determined by the religious context in which it may grow, and though often affected by this context to an extent, it is ultimately defined by the constraints of the immediate situations faced by the social groups actively involved in the formation of the national consciousness.”

Her assertion toward the issue is a pertinent illustration, as she essentially characterizes religion as mere “exigencies of salvation and the responsibility of man before his Creator that each man must meet alone.” On the other hand, even she stated, “nationalism is an essentially secular form of consciousness, one that, indeed, sacralises the secular.”<sup>7</sup> In some cases, nationalism itself is even considered secular by necessity. Ernest Gellner confirmed the fact that:

“In the industrialized world high cultures prevail, but they need a state not a church, and they need a state each. That is one way of summing up the emergence of the nationalist age.”<sup>8</sup> Resistance to assertions that

---

<sup>4</sup> Thus as far back as Carlton Hayes remarked that “Nationalism has a large number of 1916 particularly quarrelsome sects, but as a whole it is the latest and nearest approach to a world-religion.” Talal Asad, *Formations of the Secular: Christianity, Islam, Modernity*, Cultural Memory in the Present (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 2003), 188.

<sup>5</sup> Elie Kedourie, *NATIONALISM* (London: Hutchinson University Library, 1961), 20.

<sup>6</sup> Liah Greenfeld, *Nationalism and the Mind: Essays on Modern Culture* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2006).

<sup>7</sup> Kamal Soleimani, *Islam and Competing Nationalisms in the Middle East, 1876-1926*, The Modern Muslim World (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 27.

<sup>8</sup> “[Ernest\_Gellner]\_Nations\_and\_Nationalism\_(New\_Pers(z-Lib.Org).Pdf,” n.d., 73.

nationalist discourses could spill into the domains of religious thought (or vice versa) stems from the belief that religion was/is unable to penetrate the confines of modern nationalism.”<sup>9</sup>

While the second discourse, religious nationalism, is a new discourse that seeks to harmonize the love of the nation while still carrying out religious obligations. Moreover, the presence of religion coupled with nationalism has helped fighters' struggle in various wars, especially in the eastern region. In many nationalist movements, religious influence or presence is clearly visible. However, religion's functions and role in shaping nationalist discourse (or vice versa) seldom become the focus of scholarly investigations of nationalist movements.<sup>10</sup> Nevertheless, secular nationalism was very dominant and significantly impacted Muslim countries.

## 1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The development of nationalism in Indonesia can be said to be something unique. It is very different from what has happened in the west and other Muslim countries. Religion, in which Islam is the majority group, has a very important role in shaping the characteristics of nationalism. In other words, Islam was not just a common bond; it was, indeed, a sort of in-group symbol against an alien intruder and oppressor of a different religion.<sup>11</sup> Thus, it is not surprising that Islam and nationalism can emerge and unite due to western colonialism, which also involves Christian missions. However, it would be tough to interpret the term nationalism if it is related to the struggle of Muslims in liberating their homeland, nation, and religion from the oppression of the West.<sup>12</sup> This was caused by the falsification of historical facts and the attempts of de-Islamization by the colonialists and their henchmen from the orientalist.

The influence of nationalism in Indonesia is enormous because it is supported by other ideologies such as secularism, modernism, and communism. Furthermore, the

---

<sup>9</sup> Soleimani, *Islam and Competing Nationalisms in the Middle East, 1876-1926*, 2016, 22.

<sup>10</sup> Kamal Soleimani, *Islam and Competing Nationalisms in the Middle East, 1876-1926*, The Modern Muslim World (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 22.

<sup>11</sup> George McTurnan Kahin, *Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia* (Cornell University Press, 1952), 38.

<sup>12</sup> Ahmad Mansur Suryanegara, *Api Sejarah 1, Mahakarya Perjuangan Ulama Dan Santri Dalam Menegakkan Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia* (Bandung: Penerbit Suryadinasti, 1435), 257.

spirit of this movement became even more expansive when Indonesian youth studying in Europe took part in nationalism and applied it in the organizations they formed. Besides, the influence of pan-Islamism echoed by Muslim leaders in Arab countries is also considered to have a role. Muslims in Indonesia particularly have often been involved in theoretical and ideological controversies, either with secular nationalists or amongst themselves. These factors eventually led to polemics and conflicts between fighters of the independence movement.<sup>13</sup>

The strife between them did not stop overnight, from the beginning of colonialism to independence and even after that. Sukarno represents the secular nationalist group, and the religious nationalist group consists of prominent Muslim figures such as Haji Agus Salim, HAMKA, Moh. Natsir, A. Hassan, and others were involved in this upheaval. Moreover, the contributions of these significant national figures have never been doubted by any party. Their struggles, labor, and ideological debates around them have indirectly built the character of this nation. Therefore, this study is needed to analyze the ideas of these figures, especially those related to the ideology of nationalism that developed and accompanied the struggle of the Indonesians against colonialism.

### **1.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY**

This research aims to study on the development of nationalism throughout history, especially in the context of the Indonesian struggle against colonialism. It will highlight the ideological side of nationalism regardless of the political issues that lie within it. Based on historical facts, nationalism and its ideas and extensive discourses often intersect with religion, even with other ideologies. Furthermore, this study is focused on the arguments and criticisms as well that came from the religious nationalist (later known as Muslim nationalist), who have been involved in many disputes with the secular nationalist regarding the national principles and other ideological issues. Together with the analysis from the researcher, this study also seeks to reveal historical facts related with the relationship between Islam and nationalism and its direct impact

---

<sup>13</sup> Deliar Noer, *The Modernist Muslim Movement in Indonesia 1900-1942* (Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1973), 4.

to the Muslim ummah. Moreover, the role of Pancasila<sup>14</sup> in this issue is also worth examining, as it can mediate ideological disputes within the Indonesian nation.

#### **1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

This research intends to answer the following questions:

1. What is the origin and development of nationalism?
2. How did religious nationalism emerge in Indonesia and what are the ideas of religious nationalists on nationalism?
3. What are the views of Haji Agus Salim, HAMKA, Moh. Natsir, and A. Hassan on religious nationalism in Indonesia?

#### **1.5 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES**

The main objectives of this research are as follows:

1. To study the origin and development of nationalism.
2. To analyze the emergence of religious nationalism in Indonesia and the ideas of religious nationalists on nationalism?
3. To examine the views of Haji Agus Salim, HAMKA, Moh. Natsir, and A. Hassan on religious nationalism.

#### **1.6 SCOPE OF THE STUDY**

This is an analytical study of the various ideas of some scholars, who are often said to be Muslim nationalist figures. Together with some analysis and critics, the study

---

<sup>14</sup> Pancasila is known as the state ideology of Indonesia consisting of five basic principles. It functions as the philosophical basis and the national ideology of the state as well as the way of life for Indonesian society. Faisal Ismail, *Islam, Politics and Ideology in Indonesia: A Study of the Process of Muslim Acceptance of the Pancasila* (Dissertation, Montreal, Canada, McGill University, 1995), 3. For further explanation of Pancasila see Chapter 3.

attempts to find out the facts and issues around Indonesian nationalism. Especially, those related to the emergence of religious nationalism as the basis of the Indonesian struggle against colonialism. This research also seeks to highlight this struggle from the perspective of ideology and its relation to religion, without neglecting its nature as a political movement.

## **1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study is descriptive, analytical, and mainly based on library research. The main literature consists of books, articles, and websites. The focus of the research is to study comparatively the differences between the ideas of some scholars regarding the existence of religious nationalism in the context of Indonesia, especially during the colonial era. Hence, data will be collected to support the analysis of the idea of nationalism that occurred in Indonesia. In the end, the collected data will be analyzed to discover solutions to the issue of religious nationalism.

## **1.8 LITERATURE REVIEW**

The ideology of nationalism is not new. It has emerged since the eighteenth century, from the era of modernism to the era of postmodernism and from the era of colonialism to the era of postcolonialism. It has become a topic of discussion both within academia and the community. However, the focus of this study is the development of this ideology and its role together with Islam in the Indonesian struggle against Colonialism.

Firstly, the literature that will be used as a reference in this study is related to the history and the ideas of nationalism, as will be mentioned below. Hans Kohn, in his book, *Nationalism its meaning and history*, had defined it as a state of mind, in which the supreme loyalty of the individual is felt to be due to the nation-state. A deep attachment to one's native soil, to local traditions, and to established territorial authority has existed in varying strength throughout history.<sup>15</sup> Similarly, as Steven Grosby added,

---

<sup>15</sup> Hans Kohn, *Nationalism, Its Meaning and History*, rev. ed., reprint ed, An Anvil Original 8 (Malabar, Fla: Krieger, 1982), 9.

nationalism repudiates civility and the differences that it tolerates by attempting to eliminate all differing views and interests for the sake of one vision of what the nation has been and should be.<sup>16</sup> Then, at the end of the eighteenth century, nationalism in the modern sense of the word became a generally recognized sentiment, increasingly molding all public and private life.<sup>17</sup> Additionally, in the twentieth century, it has become a worldwide movement, and its importance in Asia and Africa is growing with every year. Moreover, Hans Kohn has also clearly explained the ideas of nationalism and its development in his other works, such as *The Idea of Nationalism*<sup>18</sup> and *Nationalism and Imperialism in the Hither East*.<sup>19</sup> Other than that, the researcher will also take some literature related to the definition and development of nationalism such as *Nations and Nationalism: A Global Historical Overview*<sup>20</sup>, *Nation and Identity in Contemporary Europe*,<sup>21</sup> and to elaborate this idea ideologically, and he needs another book, that is *The Oxford Handbook of Political Ideologies*.<sup>22</sup>

Liah Greenfeld, a nationalism theorist, has also defined this nationalism from a different perspective. She relates nationalism with the social conditions of society. She proposed that nationalism was the constitutive element of modernity. She has supported extensive and thorough comparative historical research based on the hypothesis. Moreover, what she revealed also led to the definition of nationalism as a secular image of reality, the socio-political component of which consisted of sovereign communities of equal members—nations. That is what she mentioned in her work, *Nationalism and the Mind*.<sup>23</sup> In the same way, Talal Asad, in his book, argued that nationalism is a part of secularism, or it can be said that ideas cannot be separated from secular elements.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> Steven Elliott Grosby, *Nationalism: A Very Short Introduction*, A Very Short Introduction 134 (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2005).

<sup>17</sup> Hans Kohn, *Nationalism, Its Meaning and History*, rev. ed., reprint ed, An Anvil Original 8 (Malabar, Fla: Krieger, 1982).

<sup>18</sup> Hans Kohn, *The Idea of Nationalism, A Study in Its Origins and Background* (New York: The Macmillan Company, n.d.).

<sup>19</sup> Hans Kohn, *Nationalism and Imperialism in the Hither East* (London: George Routledge and Sons, LTD., 1932).

<sup>20</sup> Guntram Henrik Herb and David H. Kaplan, eds., *Nations and Nationalism: A Global Historical Overview* (Santa Barbara, Calif.: ABC-CLIO, 2008).

<sup>21</sup> Brian Jenkins and Spyros A. Sofos, eds., *Nation and Identity in Contemporary Europe* (London: Routledge, 1996).

<sup>22</sup> Michael Freedon, Lyman Tower Sargent, and Marc Stears, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Political Ideologies*, First published in paperback (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

<sup>23</sup> Greenfeld, *Nationalism and the Mind*.

<sup>24</sup> Asad, *Formations of the Secular*.

Moreover, concerning modernism, the researcher will take *Nationalism and Modernism*<sup>25</sup> by Anthony Smith as the primary source.

Ernest Gellner gave his opinion, nationalism is primarily a political principle, which holds that the political and the national unit should be congruent. Nationalism as a sentiment or movement can best be defined in terms of this principle.<sup>26</sup> Nationalist sentiment is the feeling of anger aroused by the violation of the principle or the feeling of satisfaction aroused by its fulfilment. A nationalist movement is one actuated by a sentiment of this kind.<sup>27</sup>

Elie Kedourie has identified nationalism that was invented in Europe. It pretends to supply a criterion for determining the unit of population proper to enjoy a government exclusively its own, for the legitimate exercise of power in the state, and the proper organization of a society of states.<sup>28</sup> Briefly, the doctrine holds that humanity is naturally divided into nations. Those nations are known by certain characteristics which can be ascertained, and that the only legitimate type of government is national self-government.

At the end of the nineteenth century, the idea of nationalism had spread to almost all Muslim countries in Asia and Africa. However, the spirit of nationalism that arose in these countries was due to the encouragement of anti-colonial feelings. Likewise, the fact has also been explained by Zeenath Kausar in her work, *Colonization and Globalization: "Might is Right" Continues*.<sup>29</sup> Some Muslim scholars have reminded how dangerous this ideology is both as a movement and propaganda for the life of the Muslim community. Because this is part of the secularization and westernization that is echoed by the West to weaken Muslims as a whole. In the book *Islam and Competing Nationalisms in the Middle East 1876-1926*, Kamal Soleimani pointed out. By quoting some ideas from previous scholars, he said those major theorists of nationalism have

---

<sup>25</sup> Anthony D. Smith, *Nationalism and Modernism: A Critical Survey of Recent Theories of Nations and Nationalism* (London and New York: Routledge, n.d.).

<sup>26</sup> "[Ernest\_Gellner]\_Nations\_and\_Nationalism\_(New\_Pers(z-Lib.Org).Pdf," 1.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid, 4.

<sup>28</sup> Elie Kedourie, *Nationalism*, (London: Hutchinson University Library, 1961), 9.

<sup>29</sup> Zeenath Kausar, *Colonization to Globalization: "Might Is Right" Continues*, 01 (Malaysia: Thinker's Library Sdn. Bhd, 2007).

tended to assume that modern nationalism is secular by necessity.<sup>30</sup> Based on the fact, in the industrialized world, high cultures prevail, but they need a state, not a church, and they need a state each. That is one way of summing up the emergence of the nationalist age. Furthermore, in his book *Islam and Nationalism*, Ali Mohammed Naqvi also pointed out another fact. Today, Islam is not confronting idolatry, Christianity, and Zoroastrianism, it is confronting communism and nationalism.<sup>31</sup> In other words, according to him, nationalism is an imported school that has been exported by exploiting powers to disturb the unity of the Islamic world.<sup>32</sup>

In his book *State, Nationalism, and Islamization*, Raja M Salim argues that Islam and nationalism have a quite unique relationship. Islam should have a significant role in forming a nation-state and have the opportunity for the Islamization process in government. In this book, he also divides nationalism into two parts, secular nationalism and religious nationalism.<sup>33</sup> He related the terms he used to the cases in Turkey and Pakistan. On the other hand, Abdullah al-Ahsan, in his book *Ummah or Nation? Identity Crisis in Contemporary Muslim Society*, he identified that the emergence of nationalism in majority Muslim countries had caused a dilemma and worries for Muslims.<sup>34</sup> As well as the struggle they have fought in the fight against the western invaders. Additionally, he concentrated on the concept of nationalism related to the emergence of nation-states in Muslim lands. Thus, to limit his discussion, he only focused on the literature concerning the emergence of Muslim nation-states, especially in Turkey. In the same way, Al-Faruqi, in his book *Al-Tawhid: Its Implications for Thought and Life*,<sup>35</sup> reminded that Muslims should return to their nature, namely awareness of the unity of Muslims or to the concept of *Ummah* or known as Ummatism. In order to stick to the principle of *Al-Tawhid* and not be fanatic on certain groups.

---

<sup>30</sup> Soleimani, *Islam and Competing Nationalisms in the Middle East, 1876-1926*, 2016, 22.

<sup>31</sup> Ali Mohammed Naqvi, "Islam and Nationalism," *Islamic Propagation Organization*, 1985, 2.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid*, 10.

<sup>33</sup> Raja M. Ali Saleem, *State, Nationalism, and Islamization: Historical Analysis of Turkey and Pakistan*, Palgrave Studies in Religion, Politics, and Policy (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, Imprint Springer Nature, 2017).

<sup>34</sup> Abdullah al Ahsan, *Ummah or Nation? Identity Crisis in Contemporary Muslim Society* (Leicester, U.K: Islamic Foundation, 1992).

<sup>35</sup> Ismā'īl Rāḡī al-Fārūqī, *Al Tawhīd: Its Implications for Thought and Life*, 2nd ed., special ed. by A. S. Noordeen, Issues in Islamic Thought 4 (Herndon, VA: International Institute of Islamic Thought, 1992).

The polemic between Islam and nationalism or, in other terms, religious nationalism and secular nationalism does not stop there as the focus of the researcher in this study is to focus on polemics between the two in the history of the Indonesian nation during the fight against colonialism. Before the ideology of nationalism emerged and developed in Indonesia, Muslim scholars first realized the spirit of Indonesia to be free from the clutches of the invaders. In his book *A History of Modern Indonesia since c. 1200*, M.C Ricklefs pointed out that the rise of the Muslim power at that time was influenced by the spirit of pan-Islamism, which was introduced by its leaders such as Jamaluddin al-Afghani, Rasyid Ridha, and M. Abduh. This is marked by the publication of *Al-Manar* magazine in Indonesia.<sup>36</sup> Nationalism itself was only able to show its existence when it was introduced by Indonesian youths who had just returned from Europe. Accordingly, the study will take several references as the primary sources, especially, that related to the History of Indonesian people in facing western colonialism, such as *API Sejarah, Mahakarya Perjuangan Ulama dan Santri*,<sup>37</sup> *Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia*,<sup>38</sup> *The Struggle of Islam In Modern Indonesia*,<sup>39</sup> and *Islam and Colonialism: becoming modern in Indonesia and Malaya*.<sup>40</sup>

The polemic between Islam as an identity for this nation and nationalism continued with the emergence of a debate between Sukarno as the founding father of the country and A. Hassan as a famous Muslim scholar at that time.<sup>41</sup> For Sukarno, the nationalism that separated religion from the state was the right choice to be the basis of the nation's struggle. This ideology, according to him, is an idea that was developed in the West, which is oriented towards solidarity, built on the concept of nationalism or love for the motherland.<sup>42</sup> The discourse of nationalism that was meant by Sukarno was opposed by Hassan. For him, nationalism was *'aṣabiyah*, which meant the same tribalism that the Arabs had before the arrival of Islam. Those who have this

---

<sup>36</sup> M. C. Ricklefs, *A History of Modern Indonesia since c. 1200*, (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2001).

<sup>37</sup> Ahmad Mansur Suryanegara, *Api Sejarah 1, Mahakarya Perjuangan Ulama Dan Santri Dalam Menegakkan Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia*.

<sup>38</sup> George McTurnan Kahin, *Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia*.

<sup>39</sup> B. J. Boland, *The Struggle of Islam in Modern Indonesia* (Springer-Science+Business Media, B.V, 1971).

<sup>40</sup> Muhamad Ali, *Islam and Colonialism: Becoming Modern in Indonesia and Malaya* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016).

<sup>41</sup> Faujian Esa Gumelar and R.M. Mulyadi, "POLEMIC A. HASSAN DAN MUCHTAR LUTHFI MENGENAI PAHAM KEBANGSAAN (1929-1935)," *Patanjala : Jurnal Penelitian Sejarah dan Budaya* 10, no. 3 (November 8, 2018): 523, <https://doi.org/10.30959/patanjala.v10i3.420>.

<sup>42</sup> Sukarno, *Di Bawah Bendera Revolusi*, (Jakarta: Panitia penerbit, 1 Januari 1964).

understanding will be more concerned with their own tribes than solidarity in Islam.<sup>43</sup> Dialogues between these two figures are summarized in the book *Dialog Bung Karno-A.Hassan*.<sup>44</sup> Further, Sukarno was also involved in a long debate with Natsir on this issue, as is illustrated in some literature.<sup>45</sup> As also discussed in *Soekarno, Islam dan Nasionalisme*<sup>46</sup>, which contained Soekarno's ideas about nationalism. In his book, *Urat Tunggang Pantjasila*<sup>47</sup>, Hamka concluded that Pancasila is the final result of the ideological struggle experienced by this nation. Then, many of Hamka's other works contained big ideas about nationalism and Pancasila, such as *Revolusi Agama Menuju Negara*<sup>48</sup>, which explained the situation of upheaval between Islam and other ideologies including nationalism during the colonial period. Other than that, *Keadilan Sosial dalam Islam* also described the principles in *Pancasila* and its position as the state ideology.

Additionally, as the main object of the research, this study will refer to some kinds of literature accordingly. Deliar Noer has mentioned the conflict between Muslim nationalists and secular nationalists in his book *The Modernist Muslim in Indonesia*<sup>49</sup>. Another figure who is also very influential in the nationalism movement is H. Agus Salim, whose life history and ideas can be known from many books about him, one of which is *Islam and Nationalism*<sup>50</sup>. Charles Kurzman, in his book *Modernist Islam 1840-1940*,<sup>51</sup> summarized the biographies of several great Muslim figures with strong ties to the emergence of religious nationalism. So, the emergence of this idea is also closely related to the influence of pan-Islamism, which accompanied the nationalist movement in the Middle East, as mentioned in *Islamic Nationhood and Colonial Indonesia* written by Laffan.<sup>52</sup>

---

<sup>43</sup> Badri Khaerumam, *Persatuan Islam: Sejarah Pembaruan Pemikiran* ( Bandung: FAPPI dan IRIS press, 2010).

<sup>44</sup> M. Thalib & Haris Fajar, *Pembaharuan Faham Islam Di Indonesia, Dialog Bung Karno-A. Hassan* (Yogyakarta: Sumber Ilmu, 1985).

<sup>45</sup> Natsir: *Politik Santun Di Antara Dua Rezim* (Jakarta: KPG TEMPO, 2008).

<sup>46</sup> Badri Yatim, *Soekarno, Islam Dan Nasionalisme* (Jakarta: Logos Wacana Ilmu, n.d.).

<sup>47</sup> HAMKA, *Urat Tunggang Pantjasila* (Jakarta: Pustaka Keluarga, 1952).

<sup>48</sup> HAMKA, *Revolusi Agama Menuju Negara*, Tjetakan Ketiga (Jakarta: Pustaka Islam, 1952).

<sup>49</sup> Deliar Noer, *The Modernist Muslim Movement in Indonesia 1900-1942*.

<sup>50</sup> Erni Haryanti Kahfi, *Islam and Nationalism: Agus Salim and Nationalist Movement in Indonesia During the Early Twentieth Century* (Jakarta: Logos, 2001).

<sup>51</sup> Charles Kurzman, *Modernist Islam 1840-1940* (Oxford University Press, 2002).

<sup>52</sup> Michael Francis Laffan, *Islamic Nationhood and Colonial Indonesia: The Umma below the Winds*, SOAS RoutledgeCurzon Studies on the Middle East 1 (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003).

Numerous works from articles and journals also need mentioning here, especially those related to nationalism itself and its connection with *Pancasila* as the state philosophy. Among them, *Nationalism, Islam, 'Secularism', and the state in contemporary Indonesia*<sup>53</sup>. This article was written by R.E. Elson. Also, the work was written by E Ismail, *Islam, Politics, and Ideology in Indonesia: A Study of the Process of Muslim Acceptance of the Pancasila*.<sup>54</sup> Another article by Benedict Anderson, who studied Indonesian Nationalism, is *Indonesian Nationalism Today and in the Future*<sup>55</sup>. Furthermore, the article entitled *Islam and Nationalism*<sup>56</sup> is written as a commentary and an annotated translation of the same book title.

Finally, some references and works also need to be mentioned briefly. Such as *capita selecta volumes 1 and 2*, the contents explain the thoughts of Natsir, which are summarized in his writings and speeches.<sup>57</sup> Natsir, who was the former prime minister of Indonesia in the Sukarno era, and one of the founding fathers of the nation, also has many opinions about the relationship between Islam and nationalism. It can be found in his works such as *Pemikiran dan Perjuangan M. Natsir*,<sup>58</sup> *Natsir: Pesan Perjuangan Seorang Bapak*<sup>59</sup> and *Islam, Nationalism and Democracy*<sup>60</sup>, which focused on his political biography and his views regarding Islam and nationalism. In another book, *Islam dan Kebangsaan (Islam and Nationalism)* Ahmad Hassan, also explained his ideas and thoughts on these two issues that appeared during the Colonialism era.<sup>61</sup> *Himpunan Risalah (Collection of letters)*, explained Hasan Al-Banna's view on nationalism and his messages to the Muslim youth.<sup>62</sup>

---

<sup>53</sup> R.E. Elson, "Nationalism, Islam, 'secularism' and the State in Indonesia," *Australian Journal of International Affairs* Vol.64 (June 2010).

<sup>54</sup> Faisal Ismail, "Islam, Politics and Ideology in Indonesia: A Study of the Process of Muslim Acceptance of the Pancasila." (Ottawa, National Library of Canada = Bibliothèque nationale du Canada, 1996).

<sup>55</sup> Benedict Anderson, "Indonesian Nationalism Today and in the Future," *Cornell University Southeast Asia Program* Vol. 67 (April 1999).

<sup>56</sup> Howard M. Federspiel, "Commentary on Islam and Nationalism," *Cornell University Southeast Asia Program*, Indonesia, Vol. 24 (1977).

<sup>57</sup> M. Natsir, *Capita Selecta Jilid 1 dan 2 cetakan ke-2*, (Bandung: Penerbitan Sumup Bandung, 1961).

<sup>58</sup> Dr. Tarmizi Taher dkk., *Pemikiran Dan Perjuangan Mohammad Natsir* (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1996).

<sup>59</sup> A.W. Pratiknya, *Natsir: Pesan Perjuangan Seorang Bapak* (Yogyakarta: DDII & LABDA, 1989).

<sup>60</sup> Audrey Kahin, *Islam, Nationalism, and Democracy: A Political Biography of Mohammad Natsir* (Singapore: NUS Press, 2012).

<sup>61</sup> Ahmad Hassan, *Islam dan Kebangsaan*, (Indonesia, 1977).

<sup>62</sup> Hasan Al-Banna, "Himpunan Risalah," 2012, 506.

## CHAPTER TWO

### THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONALISM

#### 2.1 SHORT DEFINITION OF NATIONALISM

Understanding nationalism must be preceded by knowing its definition, both literally and broadly. Some researchers have different perspectives on defining nationalism. The word nation derives from the Latin terms *nasci* (to be born) and *natio* (belonging together by birth or place of birth).<sup>1</sup> The initial routine sense of *natio* is thus concerned, *prima facie*, with people related by the chance of birth or birthplace.

Discussing nationalism will not be separated from the discussion about the nation-state and its relationship with nature or the biological side. Because, as we all know, the concept of nationalism initially only alludes to issues of race, color, and in certain circumstances. However, it cannot be denied that its big ideas are ideological impulses, as is commonly experienced by other ideologies.

It is more often than regarded as a human construct or invention and separate from natural causation. In this sense, making culture and the nation synonymous destabilizes the link between the nation and natural.<sup>2</sup> For some, this destabilization is not a problem; for others, it is worrying which detracts from the natural rootedness of nationalism.

Hans Kohn defined nationalism as a state of mind in which the supreme loyalty of the individual is felt to be due to the nation-state.<sup>3</sup> Human loyalty, which was limited to social groups, political organizations, and certain ideological cohesion, changed drastically after the emergence of this historical movement. In addition, nationalism has been one of the determining forces in modern history. It had succeeded in driving the revolution in the West at the end of the eighteenth century, and its influence has spread

---

<sup>1</sup> Freeden, Sargent, and Stears, *The Oxford Handbook of Political Ideologies*, 530.

<sup>2</sup> Freeden, Sargent, and Stears, 531.

<sup>3</sup> Hans Kohn, *NATIONALISM Its Meaning and History*, Revised Edition (Florida: Robert E. Krieger Publishing Company, n.d.), 5.

to almost all of Asia and Africa several centuries after. It is a historical phenomenon and thus determined by the political ideas and the social structure of the various lands where it takes root.<sup>4</sup>

In the same way, Elie Kedourie had revealed briefly that the doctrine holds that humanity is naturally divided into nations. Those nations are known by certain characteristics that can be ascertained. The only legitimate type of government is self-government.<sup>5</sup> This doctrine has indeed become a historical fact that has helped various struggles in Europe. It deserves to be recognized as a proposition that is entitled to be accepted and self-evident. Such the luck of humans, Elie argued that the fortunes of nationalism also depend as much on accident as on its own worth and character. If the doctrine came into prominence at the turn of the eighteenth century, this was the result not only of a debate in which the philosophers were engaged but also of events that invested the philosophical issues with immediate and obvious relevance.<sup>6</sup>

Some opinions said that nationalism could not be separated from patriotism. It is not wrong to state that nationalism is a patriotic feeling, in-group solidarity, or Xenophobia. However, something like patriotism, or certainly the sense of identification with and solidarity with a group and some differential treatment toward outsiders, is essentially human universal. Nationalism, however, is a particular cultural form of such boundary construction. It is a historical phenomenon, not a human universal, and it has a beginning, a process of development, and possibly an end.<sup>7</sup> Since its emergence in Europe several centuries ago, nationalism has become the most central form of identity in the modern world. Even its influence can be side by side with religious identity, which incidentally is a natural identity possessed by humans.

Ernes Gellner also explicitly emphasized that nationalism as sentiment or as a movement can best be defined as primarily a political principle, which holds that the political and the national unit should be congruent. Furthermore, nationalist sentiment itself emerged from the feeling of anger, aroused by the violation of the principle, or the

---

<sup>4</sup> Kohn, *Nationalism, Its Meaning and History*, 1982, 4.

<sup>5</sup> Elie Kedourie, *NATIONALISM*, 9.

<sup>6</sup> Elie Kedourie, 10.

<sup>7</sup> Herb and Kaplan, *Nations and Nationalism*, 4.

feeling of satisfaction aroused by its fulfillment.<sup>8</sup> Additionally, there is one particular form of violation of the nationalist principle to which nationalist sentiment is compassionate. That is when there is a merger of national territories in a larger empire, or by the local domination of an alien group.

Furthermore, there is another assumption related to the definition of nationalism, there are those who consider this ideology in all its forms is like a pathology.<sup>9</sup> It said that nationalism is the pathology of modern developmental history, as inescapable as "neurosis" in the individual, with much the same essential ambiguity attaching to it, a similar built-in capacity for a descent into dementia, rooted in the dilemmas of helplessness thrust upon most of the world (the equivalent of infantilism for societies) and largely incurable.<sup>10</sup>

It can be said so because to define it requires sufficient and careful understanding. Moreover, nationalism itself, constantly growing and developing with new paradigms, which depend on the social conditions of the society in which it appears. Once created, it became 'modular,' capable of being transplanted, with varying degrees of self-consciousness, to a great variety of social terrains, merging with a correspondingly wide variety of political and ideological constellations.<sup>11</sup>

## **2.2 THE HISTORICAL ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE NATIONALISM**

The long history of nationalism began from the sixteenth century to the eighteenth century. This was precisely when the French revolution occurred, which gave the new movement an increased dynamic force. Nationalism had become manifest, however, at the end of the eighteenth century almost simultaneously in a number of widely separated European countries.<sup>12</sup> Although it thrived in the west and got its advancement there, and

---

<sup>8</sup> "[Ernest Gellner] Nations and Nationalism (New Pers(z-Lib.Org).Pdf," n.d., 1.

<sup>9</sup> Pathology is a branch of medical science primarily concerning the cause, origin and nature of disease. It involves the examination of tissues, organs, bodily fluids and autopsies in order to study and diagnose disease. <https://www.news-medical.net/health/What-is-Pathology.aspx>.

<sup>10</sup> Benedict R. O'G Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Revised ed (London: Verso, 2006), 5.

<sup>11</sup> Anderson, 4.

<sup>12</sup> Hans Kohn, *The Idea of Nationalism, A Study in Its Origins and Background*, 1.