



الجامعة الإسلامية العالمية ماليزيا
INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA
بِوَسِيلَتِنَا مِنْكُمْ لَتَرْحَبُنَا جَمِيعًا

**AN ANALYSIS OF THE INDONESIAN NATIONAL
TEXTBOOK: *ENGLISH FOR SENIOR HIGH
SCHOOL, BOOK 3 FOR THE THIRD YEAR
NATURAL AND SOCIAL SCIENCE PROGRAMS***

BY

MARYAM SOROHITI

**A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL
FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF HUMAN
SCIENCES IN TEACHING OF ENGLISH AS A
SECOND LANGUAGE**

**KULLIYAH OF ISLAMIC REVEALED
KNOWLEDGE AND HUMAN SCIENCES
INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY
MALAYSIA**

APRIL 2005

ABSTRACT

In response to the implementation of the 1994 English curriculum in Indonesia, the national textbook *English for Senior High School, Book 3 for the Third Year for Social and Natural Science Programs* was published in 1997 as a compulsory core textbook used for the third year high school students (18-19 years old). This study investigated the match between the textbook and the revised syllabus of 1994 curriculum in terms of learning objectives, themes, functional skills and learning activities. It analysed the tasks in the textbook using the checklist adapted from Littlejohn's task analysis framework. The findings reveal that the textbook which is organized in 16 themes and consisted of 262 tasks (originally 222 tasks) has the following skill distribution: 146 (55.7%) reading tasks, 3 (1.1%) listening tasks, 66 (25.2%) speaking tasks and 47 (18%) writing tasks. It was also found that the match between the tasks and the learning objective categories recommended by the curriculum is 59.5% which means that in terms of learning objectives, the textbook is fairly relevant to the curriculum. The match between the tasks and the recommended themes is 100% which suggests that in terms of themes, the textbook is relevant to the curriculum. In terms of functional skills, the textbook is not relevant to the curriculum since the match between the tasks and the categories of functional skills in the curriculum is only 7.6%. As for learning activities, the textbook is also considered not relevant to the curriculum as the match between the tasks and the learning activities recommended by the curriculum is only 30%. The results show that the textbook should be replaced with a new one, relevant to the curriculum to include categories that fulfill the recommended learning objectives, themes, functional skills and learning activities.

ملخص البحث

1997

1994

English for Senior High School, Book 3 for Third

Year for Social and Natural Science Programs

(19 28) .

1994

.Littlejohn

146 : ()
(% 25.2) (% 1.1) (% 55.7)

.(% 18)

.% 59.5

. % 7.6

.% 30

APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standard of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Human Sciences in Teaching of English as a Second Language.

Isarji Hj. Sarudin
Supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standard of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Human Sciences in Teaching of English as a Second Language.

Normala Bt. Othman
Examiner

This thesis was submitted to the Department of English language and Literature and is accepted as a partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Human Sciences in Teaching of English as a Second Language.

Umar Abdurrahman
Head, Department of English
Language & Literature

This thesis was submitted to the Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences and is accepted as partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Human Sciences in Teaching of English as a Second Language.

Hazizan Md. Noon
Dean, Kulliyah of Islamic
Revealed Knowledge and
Human Sciences

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis is the result of my own investigation, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Name: Maryam Sorohiti

Signature Date.....

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

**DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF
UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH**

Copyright © 2005 by Maryam Sorohiti. All rights reserved.

**AN ANALYSIS OF THE INDONESIAN NATIONAL TEXTBOOK: *ENGLISH
FOR SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL, BOOK 3 FOR THE THIRD YEAR NATURAL
AND SOCIAL SCIENCE PROGRAMS***

No part of this unpublished research may be produced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below.

1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional or academic purposes.
3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

Affirmed by Maryam Sorohiti

.....

Signature

.....

Date

Dedicated to

*my beloved mother Hj. Sukarti and
the memory of my father H. Muhammad Wasito*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillah. First and foremost, I thank Allah SWT for giving me the strength and guidance to bring this research to its completion. Without His mercy, none of this would have been possible.

My utmost gratitude is to the following people who have supported me in completing my studies. I would like to acknowledge my respected supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Isarji Hj. Sarudin who inspired me during his class to carry out research on material evaluation. I am indeed grateful to him for his supervision and valuable advice. My appreciation also goes to my second reader, Dr. Normala Bt. Othman for her detailed suggestions. I would also like to thank Dr. Ainol Madziah Zubairi for being my acting supervisor in the approval meeting of my proposal. Her kindness will never be forgotten. I am also fortunate to have Prof. Dr. Hassan Ahmed Ibrahim who had given me helpful advice.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to the Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta (UMY) for sponsoring my study: Prof. Dr. Achmad Mursyidi, Dr. Khairuddin, Dra. Mutia Hariati, MSi, Rahmawati, MCP and my friends in UMY Language Center who have helped me in many ways. I must thank Drs. Mahmud Janal and Nur Fatimah, SPd for providing me with some research material, Sr. Nina (DELL) and Puan Rohani (CELPAD) for their kind help.

To Yuli Utami, Shamsad Begham, Susilorini, who are my special friends in discussions as well as in sharing tears and laughters, to Mas Djoko Suprpto, Pak Masyhudi, Pak Chandra, Dik Yeti, Dik Di, Dik Rina, Ratna, Br. Matin and many others who have helped me, I thank you from the bottom of my heart for your encouragement, advice, prayers and friendship.

Finally, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my family: Ibunda Hj. Sukarti, Mas Momo, Mas Hanung, Mbak Antrit, Hudono and Taufikana for their unconditional love, continuous support and prayers throughout my life. I always know where to go to when difficult times come. *Alhamdulillah.*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Abstract in Arabic	iii
Approval Page.....	iv
Declaration	v
Acknowledgements.....	viii
List of Tables	xi
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
Background of the Study	1
Statement of the Problem	3
Research Objectives	4
Research Questions	5
Significance of the Study.....	5
Scope of the Study.....	6
Conceptual Definition of Terms	6
Organization of Chapters.....	7
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	8
Introduction	8
Indonesian 1994 English Curriculum/Syllabus.....	8
The Role of Teaching Materials	11
Textbook Evaluation	13
Studies related to textbook evaluation.....	16
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY	19
Introduction	19
Source of the Data	19
Instrument.....	21
Procedure.....	23
Data Analysis.....	30
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION	32
Introduction	32
Distribution of Skills	32
Learning Objectives.....	33
Reading.....	34
Listening	44
Speaking	46
Writing.....	48
Themes	52
Functional Skills.....	55
Learning Activities	59
Reading.....	60
Listening.....	63
Speaking	65
Writing.....	68

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION	71
Introduction	71
Summary of the Study and Findings	71
Limitation of the study	72
Recommendations	72
Suggestions for Future Research	73
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 75
 APPENDIX	 78

List of Tables

Table 3.1: The features of the textbook and the categories in the curriculum	20
Table 3.2: I. Learning Objectives: Reading, Listening, Speaking & Writing	22
Table 3.3: II. Themes	22
Table 3.4: III. Functional Skills	22
Table 3.5: IV. Learning Activities: Reading, Listening, Speaking & Writing	22
Table 3.6: Learning Objectives: Reading	31
Table 4.1: The Distribution of the four skills in the tasks	32
Table 4.2: Learning Objectives	34
Table 4.3: Learning Objectives: Reading	35
Table 4.4: Reading: Text Forms	35
Table 4.5: Reading: Length of text	40
Table 4.6: Reading Skills	40
Table 4.7: Learning Objectives: Listening	44
Table 4.8: Learning Objectives: Speaking	46
Table 4.9: Learning Objectives: Writing	49
Table 4.10: Distribution of Themes	52
Table 4.11: Functional Skills recommended by the curriculum	56
Table 4.12: Learning Activities	59
Table 4.13: Learning Activities: Reading	61
Table 4.14: Learning Activities: Listening	63
Table 4.15: Learning Activities: Speaking	65
Table 4.16: Learning Activities: Writing	68

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background of the Study

A textbook plays an important role in the teaching and learning process. Perhaps, this is the reason why most English teachers use a textbook in their class. Textbooks are important resources for teaching both productive and receptive skills. They further guide less experienced teachers who have yet to gain confidence (Cunningsworth 1995). It is not surprising that some teachers “use a textbook as the backbone of their courses” (Graves 2000: 174). Many novice teachers lack the experience and confidence to prepare their own materials and rely on the textbook to ease their burden. Some teachers, experienced and inexperienced, simply follow what is presented in the textbook, while others supplement it by using materials from other textbooks or sources.

It may be beneficial if class teachers create their own materials for their students since they have personal experience and knowledge of each class. They know their students’ backgrounds, needs and learning conditions best. However, not many teachers have either the expertise or time to create their own materials. Allwright points out:

... we need teaching materials as carriers of decisions best made by someone other than the classroom teacher, not because the classroom teacher is deficient, as a classroom teacher, but because the expertise required of materials writers is importantly different from that required of classroom teachers – the people who have the interpersonal skills to make classrooms good places to learn it (1981: 6).

Based on what Allwright says, it is necessary for teachers to use published textbooks

instead of their own materials as the core of the course. Textbook writers provide more systematic and carefully developed syllabus-based materials. They usually have better resources than the classroom teachers do. Furthermore, in many cases teachers often have little choice in the selection of the textbook since they must use those approved by the Ministry of Education.

In Indonesia, the Department of Education and Culture publishes the compulsory core textbooks for all public schools. These textbooks, including the English textbook for senior high schools, are supposedly written based on the syllabus of the national curriculum. In other words, the textbook should reflect the curriculum to ensure that the objectives of the teaching and learning process can be achieved. However, the textbook does not always reflect the curriculum. For example, the 1984 curriculum recommended the communicative approach. Yet, in the same year, the Department of Education and Culture published new English textbooks which did not reflect the approach recommended, as they were structural in nature.

A decade later, to improve the quality of English teaching and learning in Indonesia, the government replaced the 1984 English curriculum with the 1994 one. In response to this curriculum, national English textbooks for senior high schools were revised throughout Indonesia. In 1999, the government again revised the senior high school English syllabus and issued a revised version of the 1994 syllabus known as the ‘Supplement to the Broad Outline of Teaching Program’ (*Suplemen GBPP – Kurikulum 1994*).

The terms ‘curriculum’ and ‘syllabus’ in Indonesia are not strictly differentiated (Shudana 2001). ‘Curriculum’ is also called *GBBP – Garis-garis Besar Program*

Pengajaran (the Broad Outline of Teaching Program). For the purpose of this study, the terms ‘curriculum’ and ‘syllabus’ are used interchangeably to mean the same thing.

The *Suplemen GBBP* stated that the modification did not change the basic competencies the students should master so that the national textbooks could continually be used as core textbooks. This was due to the fact that the 1999 syllabus is substantially the same as the 1994 syllabus. Therefore, it could be assumed that the national English textbooks for senior high school reflect the revised syllabus as well as the 1994 syllabus. However, to determine whether the textbooks actually reflect what is required by the revised syllabus of the 1994 curriculum, an analysis of the national textbooks needs to be carried out.

In this study an Indonesian national textbook: *English for Senior High School, Book 3 for the Third Year Natural and Social Science Programs* was analyzed. The main purpose was to investigate the match between the tasks in the textbook and the categories in the 1999 revised syllabus of the 1994 curriculum in terms of learning objectives, themes, functional skills and learning activities.

Statement of the Problem

As stated in the 1994 curriculum, the objectives of teaching English in senior high schools in Indonesia are for the students to master reading, listening, speaking, as well as writing, with the emphasis on reading as a continuation of the teaching of English at the basic education level. To meet these objectives, the government has taken many steps, including imposing national textbooks for senior high school. It is expected that the textbooks present materials that can allow the students to achieve the objectives.

However, the problem is that in Indonesia the standards in textbook writing are still far from satisfactory (Alwasilah 2002). This may raise a question as to whether the textbooks actually present the materials required by the curriculum. This question needs to be answered because as McNeill (1995) indicates, not every textbook contains all materials required by the curriculum.

Although the revised syllabus of the 1994 curriculum states that the textbook can still be used as a core textbook since the modifications did not improve the basic competence, no study has been done on its relevancy. Since many Indonesian teachers tend to follow the textbooks rigidly or rely almost completely on them, it is important to ensure that the textbooks reflect the curriculum. Textbooks that do not reflect the curriculum may not bring about the outcome expected by the curriculum. The matter is of some importance because as Swales (cited in Sheldon, 1988: 237) asserts, “textbooks represent a problem, and in extreme cases are examples of educational failure.”

Research Objectives

The objectives of this study include the following:

1. To investigate the degree of the match between the textbook and the learning objectives recommended by the curriculum.
2. To investigate the degree of the match between the textbook and the themes recommended by the curriculum.
3. To investigate the degree of the match between the textbook and the functional skills recommended by the curriculum.
4. To investigate the degree of the match between the textbook and the learning activities recommended by the curriculum.

Research Questions

The following research questions were addressed in this study:

1. What is the degree of the match between the textbook and the learning objectives recommended by the curriculum?
2. What is the degree of the match between the textbook and the themes recommended by the curriculum?
3. What is the degree between the match of the textbook and the functional skills recommended by the curriculum?
4. What is the degree of the match between the textbook and the learning activities recommended by the curriculum?

Significance of the Study

Since national core textbook issues are often related to Indonesian high school graduates' lack of English competency, this study is significant because it may indicate whether the government has imposed the right, if not the best, core English textbook for the students. It will determine whether or not the textbook is relevant to the revised syllabus of the 1994 curriculum as claimed in the *Suplemen GBPP*. This study could give a picture of the relationship between the third year national textbook and the English teaching program. As stated by Brown (1995: 160), "the degree of relationship between a set of materials and a particular program can best be determined by considering the degree to which the materials fit the curriculum." The findings thus will provide information to assist the Indonesian Ministry of Education to determine the relevancy of the textbook.

This study is also significant for teachers because based on the description of the

percentage of the match between the textbook and the objectives, themes, functional skills, and learning activities required by the curriculum, teachers can see if, and where, the textbook needs to be supplemented by other teaching materials. They can also use the same model to analyze other textbooks for their students' benefit.

For writers of textbooks, this study can give a picture of the textbook's strengths and weaknesses. Its strengths may support their claim that the textbook was written based on the curriculum, whereas its weaknesses could give them some input to improve the quality of textbooks in the future.

Scope of the Study

In this study, the researcher focused on "the analysis of the materials "as they are", with the content and ways of working which they propose, and *not*, it must be stressed, with what may actually happen in the classroom" (Littlejohn 2001: 191). It will not cover the effectiveness of the materials in promoting learning. The study will analyze the materials in the form of tasks.

The analysis will relate the textbook to the revised syllabus of the 1994 curriculum (*Suplemen GBPP*) issued in 1999. The categories to be matched with the tasks in the textbook are the learning objectives, themes, functional skills and learning activities. The analysis does not include the other components of the curriculum.

Conceptual Definition of Terms

The following are conceptual terms used in this study:

Learning Objectives refer to the descriptions presented in the revised 1994 curriculum

(*Suplemen GBPP*) issued in 1999 describing what the students are expected to be able to do.

Themes refer to the subject areas of broad topics set in the curriculum about which the tasks are based.

Functional Skills refer to the expressions listed in the curriculum used in reading, listening, speaking or writing tasks.

Learning Activities refer to the activities offered to complete the tasks covering reading, listening, speaking and writing listed in the curriculum.

Not available in the curriculum refers to the categories that are not found in the category lists in the curriculum or to tasks that do not have a match in the curriculum categories.

Organization of Chapters

The thesis consists of five chapters. Following Chapter 1 is a chapter on the review of the literature. Chapter 3 presents the Methodology, followed by Chapter 4 which will detail the discussion and analysis of the results. Chapter 5 concludes the thesis and offers some recommendations for future research.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

This chapter presents a review of related literature on the Indonesian 1994 English curriculum/syllabus, teaching materials, textbook evaluation, and studies related to textbook evaluation. Other reviews on the same topics are also included.

Indonesian 1994 English Curriculum/Syllabus

The analysis of a textbook cannot be separated from the discussion of the curriculum/syllabus. In many situations, it represents the hidden curriculum of the ESL course (Richards 1993). Thus, the analysis of the national textbook *English for Senior High School Book 3 for Natural and Social Science Programs* has a close relationship with the Indonesian 1994 curriculum. Luciana (1998) highlights the fact that Indonesia's 1994 English syllabus recommends a number of meaningful principles in English teaching. The principles are as follows:

1. Grammar and vocabulary are taught as a means of expressing ideas,
2. there are various expressions in speaking and writing,
3. learning English means learning to use the language to communicate,
4. authentic materials are very important, especially in order to maintain the students' motivation,
5. materials are sequenced based on content, function and meaning.

Further, she points out that the 1994 syllabus implements the integrative method of teaching the skills rather than single skill-oriented teaching.

In 1999, the government revised the senior high school English syllabus by issuing a revised version of the 1994 syllabus known as the ‘Supplement to the Broad Outline of Teaching Program’ (*Suplemen GBPP – Kurikulum 1994*). According to this document, modifications were made based on the results of research carried out by teachers, material writers, educational experts, critics and recommendations from the teachers and material writers who stated that there were problems in the English lessons. The problems were:

1. The structure and organization of the material, i.e., the substance was too open or too loose,
2. some of the communicative expressions were not in accordance with the themes,
3. the functional skills overlapped,
4. some of the learning objectives were not clear.

The document was written with the intention of not changing the minimal competencies which senior high school students have to master, and it was hoped this would not have a major impact on the teaching/learning process. In general, the adjustment to the English Curriculum for senior high school covers:

1. adjusting the examples of communicative expressions to be in line with the themes,
2. reducing the repeated functional skills,
3. changing the format of the presentation in the hope of making it easier for the teachers to understand the curriculum.

In addition, the document states that in the revised syllabus, the principles of the 1994 English curriculum are still maintained, namely:

- a. the objective of English teaching is still the development of communication skills in reading, listening, speaking and writing, in accordance with the needs brought about by globalization and advances in information technology,
- b. the mastering of language elements is used to support communication skills, either oral or written,
- c. the English syllabus is a fusion of functional, situational, skilled-based, and structural syllabuses, and therefore the material organization is not based on the language elements but upon themes and functional skills,
- d. the approach used is still the meaning/communicative approach,
- e. the evaluation system is based on integrative (more than one skill/language component) as well as communicative evaluation, and not on language mastery,
- f. not all the objectives can be measured through tests (for example, reading for pleasure).

Shudana (2001) does not consider the 1994 English curriculum to be learner-centered. However, the national curriculum did try to meet generalized students' interests. Shudhana criticized the 1994 curriculum in some aspects:

1. The teaching approach used is communicative which suggests that expressions have meaning according to their context and situation. The students' motivation determines their success in learning. The level of motivation is determined by the meaningful materials and learning activities. According to him, this is not completely true. Motivation is

actually not determined by the meaning but by the interest.

2. The vocabulary recommended by the curriculum covers a wide range of areas. As a result, the vocabulary is not covered in depth due to time constraints.
3. Functional skills are still in the context of reading.
4. The time allocated is not enough to cover the themes recommended by the curriculum.
5. The national curriculum should be changed to one suitable for the various areas in Indonesia.

This criticism of the 1994 curriculum/syllabus therefore results in a criticism of the English teaching materials since the English teaching materials are written based on the categories in the curriculum.

The Role of Teaching Materials

Teaching materials play an important role in language teaching and learning programs. “The process of learning a language is largely determined by the textbook” (Richards 2001: 13). Nunan (1988) points out that materials are essential elements in the language curriculum. Further, the important role the teaching materials play in curriculum can be seen from what Nunan (1991: 208) says: “While the syllabus defines the goals and objectives, the linguistic and experiential content, instructional materials can put flesh on the bones of these specifications.” They significantly affect the content and type of teaching and learning (Cunningsworth 1995). Similarly, Richards and Rodgers (1986: 79) point out that “materials are seen as essential components of instructional design and are often viewed as a way of influencing the quality of classroom interaction and language use.”

Writers have many ways to define teaching materials, for instance, Brown (1995: 139) defines materials as “any systematic description of the techniques and exercises to be used in classroom teaching.” Tomlinson (2001: xi) describes materials as “anything which is used to help to teach language learners.” Materials can take the form of a textbook, a workbook, a teacher’s book, a magazine, a journal, a picture, a map, a cassette, a CD-Rom, a video, a photocopied handout, a newspaper, or even a paragraph written on a whiteboard (Brown 1995; Tomlinson 2001). Thus, though the forms of materials are various, their main function is to facilitate the learning of a language.

Of these forms of teaching materials, textbooks or coursebooks, are most widely used in the teaching and learning process. Ur (1996: 183) uses the term “coursebook” to mean “a textbook of which the teacher and, usually, each student has a copy, and which is in principle to be followed systematically as the basis for a language course.” With regard to the rationale of using textbooks, Seaton (1982: 40-41) states that the coursebook or textbook acts as a visual record of progress and can be a psychological support for the students. It is also useful as a memory aid and for consolidation of class work at home. At the same time, for the teacher, it can be a syllabus. It provides a sequence of practices and presentations which are directed towards a goal.

Sheldon (1988) identifies two main reasons why textbooks are widely used. Firstly, for teachers, developing their own materials is a very difficult and demanding job. Secondly, teaching is, in itself, quite time-consuming. Consequently, teachers may lack the time to develop new materials. Therefore, the use of a textbook is an important method for teachers as well as students.

In addition, Richards (2001) highlights the benefits of using a textbook, which among others are:

1. providing structure and a syllabus for a program,
2. helping standardize instruction,
3. maintaining quality,
4. providing a variety of learning resources,
5. being efficient,
6. providing effective language models and input,
7. being able to train teachers,
8. being visually appealing.

Further, he adds that good textbooks serve to turn the guidelines in the official government syllabus into a rich source of content, texts, and activities that would be beyond the capacities of most teachers to develop on their own.

Harmer (1991: 219) comments that good textbooks also relieve the teacher from the pressure of having to think of original material for every class. Meanwhile, Hutchinson and Torres (1994) observe that, besides containing lesson plans, a well-prepared textbook conveniently presents the structure of a language-learning program. Based on these comments, it can be said that the use of textbooks is rightfully a satisfactory alternative to providing teaching materials.

Textbook Evaluation

Seaton (1982: 40) says that written materials may help one to access the relative merits of many courses that are available to the EFL teacher. Similarly, Wallace